



2950 PERALTA OAKS COURT P.O. BOX 5381 OAKLAND CALIFORNIA 94605-0381 T: 1-888-EBPARKS F: 510-569-4319 TRS RELAY: 711 WWW.EBPARKS.ORG

# BOARD EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

## Wednesday, June 17, 2015

### 12:30 p.m., Board Room

The following agenda items are listed for Committee consideration. In accordance with the Board Operating Guidelines, no official action of the Board will be taken at this meeting; rather, the Committee's purpose shall be to review the listed items and to consider developing recommendations to the Board of Directors.

A copy of the background materials concerning these agenda items, including any material that may have been submitted less than 72 hours before the meeting, is available for inspection on the District's website ([www.ebparks.org](http://www.ebparks.org)), the Headquarters reception desk, and at the meeting.

## AGENDA

<u>STATUS</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ITEM</u>	<u>STAFF</u>
D	12:30 pm	1. 2016 Fuels Management Program and Costs Analysis	McCormick
		2. Public Comments	
		3. Board Comments	

(R) Recommendation for Future Board Consideration

(I) Information

(D) Discussion

### Executive Committee Members

Whitney Dotson (Chair); Doug Siden; Ayn Wieskamp  
Beverly Lane, Alternate  
Robert E. Doyle, Staff Coordinator

### Future Meetings:

<del>January 8</del>	July 9
<del>February 12</del>	August 13
<del>March 12</del>	September 10
<del>April 9</del>	October 8
<del>May 28</del>	November 12
<del>June 17 (Wed)</del>	December 10

### Distribution/Agenda

#### District:

AGMs  
Erich Pfuehler  
Yolande Barial  
Connie Swisher  
Mimi Waluch  
Sharon Clay  
Katie Quick  
Monique Salas

#### Public:

Norman LaForce  
Peter Rauch  
Mary McAllister  
Rich Guarienti (via e-mail)  
Pat O'Brien (via e-mail)  
Bruce Beyaert (via e-mail)  
Patricia Vaughan Jones (via e-mail)  
Ted Radosevich (via e-mail)

### Distribution/Full Packet

#### District:

Board Members  
Robert Doyle  
Jim O'Connor  
Dave Collins  
Bob Nisbet  
Larry Tong  
Mark Ragatz  
Allen Pulido  
Cliff Rocha – Local 2428  
Eri Suzuki – Local 2428  
Tyrone Davis – POA  
Lobby/Receptionist

#### Project Manager(s):

Dan McCormick



**BOARD EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Meeting of June 17, 2015

**TO:** Board Executive Committee

**FROM:** Robert Doyle, General Manager

**STAFF REPORT  
PREPARED BY:** Dan McCormick, Fire Chief  
Jeff Rasmussen, Assistant Finance Officer

**SUBJECT:** 2016 Fuels Management Program of Work and Fuels Cost Analysis

---

Fire Chief Dan McCormick, Assistant Finance Officer Jeff Rasmussen, Chief of Stewardship Matt Graul, and Fire Captain Brad Gallup will present this item to the Board Executive Committee for review and discussion.

**BACKGROUND**

On April 20, 2010, the District's Board of Directors approved the *Wildfire Hazard Reduction and Resource Management Plan* (the "Plan") and the accompanying CEQA document which covers hill and shoreline parklands from Richmond to Castro Valley within the Measure CC funded area. The approved Plan recommends that a Fuels Treatment Plan be prepared, updated on an annual basis, and provided to the Board for consideration in advance of the annual budget process.

The Fire and Stewardship Departments and other members of the District's Interdisciplinary Fuels Group prepare the annual fuels plan, which includes all fuels management projects to be conducted during the year, as well as prescribed burns to meet resource objectives. This includes projects both within the Measure CC area and the District as a whole.

The overall Fuels Management Program is complex, and the annual work plan is reviewed by the Board Executive Committee in advance of the annual budget process to provide an opportunity for the Board and interested members of the public to be well informed on the progress of this critical District function. This is also an opportunity for the Board to discuss the short and long-term goals, progress to date, and costs of the program in a focused setting.

This report recaps the overall status of fuels management work previously undertaken, the work underway in 2015, and projects anticipated for 2016 and beyond. The report is updated each year to reflect the continuing progress on permits, grant applications and awards, and discusses trends, funding sources, and management strategies. The report consists of this memo supported by exhibits providing additional details of the annual work plan.

## **A. The “Plan”, Recommended Treatment Areas, Prescriptions, and Priorities**

The Plan, as adopted, is available in its entirety on the District’s website in the Stewardship/Resources section under Wildfire Hazard Reduction. The website includes a detailed location map of all of the recommended treatment areas (RTA’s), with numerical identifiers that can be cross referenced with specific information about each one. Over the past five years, staff from Fire, Stewardship, and Operations Departments have completed and posted fuels management prescriptions for each upcoming recommended treatment area (RTA), consistent with the Plan and based on site investigations by professional Fire and Stewardship staff.

Fire and Stewardship staff uses these RTA prescriptions to plan, prioritize, and conduct annual treatments based on fire hazard, permitting, staff capacity, and funding availability. The annual work plan is assembled, reviewed, and undertaken to the extent that funds are available and/or are made available through the budget process. Following each treatment cycle for either initial entry or ongoing maintenance, Stewardship staff conducts site visits and records observations regarding vegetation changes, species of concern, or any related issues. Fire and Stewardship staff updates the prescriptions for the following season if needed. All work proposed for the annual work plan complies with the adopted Plan protocols, and is in accordance with the prescriptions as they are updated on a continuing basis.

The Plan anticipates eventual initial entry and ongoing management of a total of 3,100 acres in the management zone by 2025. The District’s Fire Department manages another 273 acres of eucalyptus and other vegetation in other parks for wildfire hazard prevention purposes. By the end of 2016, with FEMA funding in place, it is expected that the acreage for which the District will be undertaking continuing maintenance (initial entry plus ongoing maintenance activities) will be approximately 860 acres in the management zone, plus 273 acres in other parks – or a total of 1,133 acres; more than one-third of the way to the long-term goal.

## **B. 2014 Recap and 2015 Outlook**

In 2014, initial entry work was completed on several sites:

- Five acre ladder fuel reduction project surrounding the Briones Service Yard.
- Fourteen acres of eucalyptus stand and surface fuel reduction project in Wildcat Canyon Park, Alvarado area.
- Thirty-four acres of wildland fuel reduction and hazard tree removal in Tilden Park along Wildcat Canyon Road.

The District’s resource management prescribed broadcast burn program is continuing in 2015. Approximately 50 acres of native prairie grassland in Point Pinole are scheduled for burning this year and five acres in eight burn plots are scheduled in Redwood Park.

By the end of 2015, a total of 22 acres of new, initial entry work is expected to be completed at Lake Chabot and Tilden. In the Plan area, approximately 750 acres across 14 parks will be maintained using goat grazing, prescribed burns, chemical, mechanical, and hand labor in accordance with the prescriptions and treatment protocols adopted in the Plan. An additional 273 acres in seven parks, which do not fall under the Plan, will also be maintained. The total area being maintained starting in 2016 will be 1,020 acres.

### **C. Grants and Permits**

The District's vegetation management program is conducted in accordance with all applicable permits and is supported in part by financial assistance from federal and state grant funding through FEMA and CalEMA. In 2010, following completion of the Plan and settlement of the CEQA lawsuit, FEMA awarded the District a nearly \$3 million grant for vegetation work in Alameda Striped Racer (formerly Whipsnake) habitat. FEMA began drafting the Biological Assessment and Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) to provide endangered species clearance for the entire Plan (the review also includes approximately \$3 million in grants to the City of Oakland and UC Berkeley). In 2013, FEMA completed the Biological Assessment and released a 3,250-page EIS for public comment and received a Biological Opinion from the US Fish & Wildlife Service for the project. The public hearing and EIS process was completed in early 2015. However, in March 2015, all the agencies were sued in federal court over the EIS.

The District may conduct the fuel management work subject to the grant funds while the litigation is pending unless an injunction were ordered. However, due to lead time needed for fuels project, it is expected that the litigation will be resolved before any work could begin. Despite the pending litigation, the issuance of the Biological Opinion from the US Fish & Wildlife Service and the approval of the EIS were significant steps in providing the District with the ability to work in identified Alameda Striped Racer habitat, and also provided for the initial release of grant funding to undertake the work. In exchange, however, the District will be required to conduct additional studies, establish permanent conservation easements, and perform additional monitoring and management work beyond that already established in the Plan.

For the above reasons, the anticipated work plan for 2016 and beyond includes provisional estimates of what work may be undertaken for the 2016 work season. Absent timely conclusion of additional studies, establishment of permanent conservation easements, and management work beyond that already established in the Plan, the work plan will be modified and reduced in scope.

#### **D. 2016 Initial Entry**

Out of the approximately 3,100 acres of treatment areas identified in the Plan, approximately 770 acres will have received initial treatment by the end of 2015. In 2016, using currently available Measure CC, General Fund-sourced monies, and FEMA grants, the District anticipates undertaking initial entry into an additional area of approximately 90 acres. Setting this very high acreage goal is necessary in order to stay on pace to complete grant requirements within the required timeline. Reaching this goal in one year (and repeating nearly the same initial treatment acres in 2017 through 2021) presents a challenge based on current staff and contract capacity. Accommodating work restrictions needed for complying with environmental conditions for fuels reduction work is another significant factor. Staff capacity to administer contracts and crews may need to be increased.

**Attachment A (Fuels Management Summary)** lists the RTA's, by park, both within and outside of the Plan area that are scheduled to be completed in 2015 and 2016.

#### **E. Ongoing Annual Maintenance**

Stewardship and Fire Department staff revisit each treated RTA periodically to assess the condition of the vegetative cover as the tree canopy is removed or reduced and the latent seed bank emerges under the new conditions. As noted previously, staff updates and adjusts the prescriptions as appropriate to maintain a safe landscape per the plan, and to minimize the incursion of invasive, non-native species. **Attachment A (Fuels Management Summary)** also lists the maintenance RTA's, by park, and the acres that will be reviewed and maintained as required.

#### **F. Costs**

Initial entry work is expensive, usually due to the major tree work involved, but costs vary widely from site to site due to access, environmental conditions, vegetation type and density, and other factors. Initial entry costs are considered to be "one time". However, as the District undertakes initial entry work in any RTA, we effectively assume the responsibility for annual monitoring and maintenance; therefore, a discussion of future costs must include for annual maintenance based on the accumulation of acres previously treated and new acres treated.

Annual maintenance work, as has been undertaken over the past several years, has averaged approximately \$1,200 per acre for annual treatments, and includes costs for mechanical treatments, hand crews, goats, and other vegetation management activities. It is anticipated that

as the preferred, more stable, mixes of vegetation are achieved under the Plan, that this annual per-acre cost number will be reduced; however, for the next several years, this per-acre cost will be used to estimate the projected future cost of the program.

**Attachment B (Estimated Costs)** models the expected costs of the program, for initial entry and ongoing annual maintenance. The initial entry work under the FEMA grant, along with other high priority initial entry projects, is expected to be completed by 2021, leaving approximately 1,200 acres of initial entry work under the Plan to be completed after that date. In 2021, after completion of FEMA and other projects, the annual maintenance cost is anticipated to be approximately \$2.25 million per year.

The cost of completing the remaining 1,200 acres of initial entry work is estimated at approximately \$4 million per year over three subsequent years, resulting in a total estimate of approximately \$12 million to complete all the initial entry work under the Plan. If completed by 2025, the annual maintenance cost for fuels management could rise to approximately \$4 million per year using the \$1,200 per acre estimate (which does not account for any cost reductions that are expected to occur due to a conversion of vegetation over time.)

**Attachment C (Funding Sources)** models the existing and potential funding sources for the program for initial entry and ongoing annual maintenance. The District currently has remaining General Fund, Measure CC, and grant funding and a number of future potential funding sources. In addition, as has been discussed, staff has suggested increasing the current \$500,000 annual base budget appropriation by \$100,000 each of the next several years to bring the annual base budget appropriation to at or near \$1 million per year.

**Existing Funding** – Expected to fund both initial entry and ongoing maintenance for at least four years:

- \$1,142,500 existing balance in 550000 Fuels Management Account
- \$4,134,919 remaining balance of Measure CC funds for Fuels Management
- \$200,000 annual undesignated Fire Operations budget
- \$500,000 annual base budget appropriation to account 550000
- \$2,750,669 initial entry grants
- \$536,100 maintenance grants

**Future Potential Funding** – This list includes funds expected, but not yet appropriated from existing sources, and possible funding sourced from grants, ballot measures, or other opportunities:

- \$500,000 annual general fund base budget appropriation to account 550000
- \$100,000 increase in base budget each year up to \$1 million annually

- \$2,800,00 first five years of Measure CC renewal
- \$1.9 million request for existing FEMA projects
- \$9 million request to FEMA for remaining initial entry projects
- \$300,000 maintenance grants from Calfire, Conservation Corps and Fire Safe Councils

Staff will continue to monitor and update these cost estimates and funding sources every year as the program moves forward. In the coming years the District will modify its plans for initial entry work as funding allows and pursue opportunities for additional grants, funding measures, and General Fund opportunities to meet our fuels management objectives and ensure that these vegetation management activities are continued on a sustainable, long-term basis.

### RECOMMENDATION

This item is for the Board Executive Committee's discussion.

Staff responsible for the Plan implementation will present the materials to the Committee, answer questions, and support the Committee's review of the program. Staff welcomes the Board Executive Committee's comments and will seek to incorporate interests raised by the Committee into the 2016 work plan and the preliminary 2016 annual District Budget.

Attachment A: Fuels Management Summary for 2014, 2015, and 2016  
Attachment B: Estimated Costs for Fuels Management 2015-2025  
Attachment C: Fuels Management Plan: Funds Available 2015-2025

**FUELS MANAGEMENT SUMMARY 2014-2015-2016**

**Attachment A**

PARK	Year 2014 (Actual)		Year 2015 (Planned)*			Year 2016 (Planned)*				
	Treated RTAs	Maint. Acres	Maint. RTAs	Maint. Acres	Initial Treat RTA	Initial Treat Acres	Maintenance RTAs	Maint. Acres	Initial Treat RTA	Initial Treat Acres
<b>WITHIN PLAN AREA</b>										
Anthony Chabot	AC001, AC004, AC006, AC007, AC008b, AC013, Poly603	291	AC001, AC003, AC004, AC006, AC007, AC008b, AC013, Poly603	296			AC001, AC003, AC004, AC006, AC007, AC008b, AC013, Poly603	296	AC013	17
Claremont Canyon	CC001, CC002, CC003, CC004, CC008, CC009	40	CC001, CC002, CC003, CC004, CC009	36			CC001, CC002, CC003, CC004, CC009	36	CC003, CC006, CC012	8
Huckleberry									HP001, HP002, HP003, HP004	19
Kennedy Grove	KG002, KG003, KG004	15	KG002, KG003, KG004	15			KG002, KG003, KG004	15		
Lake Chabot	LC009, LC010	14	LC009	14	LC009	6	LC009	20	LC010	5
Leona	LE001, LE003, LE004	18	LE001, LE003, LE004	18			LE001, LE003, LE004, LE005	18		5
Miller/Knox	MK001, MK002, MK003, MK005	11	MK001, MK002, MK003, MK005	11			MK001, MK002, MK003, MK005	11	MK001, MK002, MK003, MK004	23
Point Pinole	PP001	50	PP001	50			PP001	50		
Redwood	RD001, RD004	63	RD001, RD004	63			RD001, RD004	63		
Sibley	SR002a, SR002b, SR003, SR005	56	SR002a, SR002b, SR003, SR005	56			SR002a, SR002b, SR003, SR005	56	SR001	8
Sobrante Ridge	SO002	13	SO002	13			SO002	13		
Temescal										

\*Note: All planned work is subject to change, based on grant fund availability



FUELS MANAGEMENT SUMMARY 2014-2015-2016

Attachment A

PARK	Year 2014 (Actual)		Year 2015 (Planned)*			Initial Treat Acres	Year 2016 (Planned)*			
	Treated RTAs	Maint. Acres	Maint. RTAs	Maint. Acres	Initial Treat RTA		Maintenance RTAs	Maint. Acres	Initial Treat RTA	Initial Treat Acres
Tilden	TI002a, TI004, TI006, TI008a, TI008b, TI009, TI010, TI011, TI012, TI015, TI022	105	TI002a, TI004, TI006, TI008a,b, TI009, TI010, TI011, TI012, TI015, TI022	105	TI004, TI007a, c	16	TI002a, TI004, TI006, TI007a,c, TI008a,b, TI009, TI010, TI011, TI012, TI015, TI022	121	TI012	5
Wildcat	WC001, WC002, WC004, WC005, WC009, WC011	70	WC001, WC002, WC004, WC005, WC009, WC011	70			WC001, WC002, WC004, WC005, WC009, WC011	70		
<b>Subtotal, Within Plan</b>		<b>746</b>		<b>747</b>		<b>22</b>		<b>769</b>		<b>90</b>
<b>OUTSIDE PLAN AREA</b>										
Ardenwood	Poly998, 999	41	Poly998, 999	41			Poly998, 999	41		
Bishop Ranch	Poly924	35	Poly924	35			Poly924	35		
Briones		5		5				5		
Camp Arroyo	Poly918, 919, 920	16	Poly918, 919,920	16			Poly918, 919, 920	16		
Carquinez Shoreline	Poly992, 941-947	44	Poly992, 941-947	44			Poly992, 941-947	44		
Cull Canyon	Poly925	32	Poly925	32			Poly925	32		
Garin	Poly926-929, 993, 996	66	Poly926-929, 993, 996	66			Poly926-929, 993, 996	66		
Las Trampas	Poly923, Poly980	34	Poly923, Poly980	34			Poly923, Poly980	34		
<b>Subtotal, Outside Plan</b>		<b>273</b>		<b>273</b>	<b>0</b>			<b>273</b>		<b>0</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>		<b>1019</b>		<b>1,020</b>	<b>0</b>			<b>1,042</b>		<b>90</b>

\*Note: All planned work is subject to change, based on grant fund availability

**Fire Department's Estimated Costs for Fuels Management 2015 through 2025**

**Attachment B**

Year	New Initial Treatment - Fuels Plan Area		Maintenance - Fuels Plan Area (\$1,200 per acre)		Maintenance - Outside Fuels Plan Area (\$1,200 per acre)		Total - Initial Treatment and Maintenance	
	Acres	Cost	Acres	Cost	Acres	Cost	Acres	Cost
2015	22	\$200,000	747	\$896,400	273	\$327,600	<b>1,042</b>	<b>\$1,424,000</b>
2016	90	\$570,000	769	\$922,800	273	\$327,600	<b>1,132</b>	<b>\$1,820,400</b>
2017	151	\$1,000,000	859	\$1,030,800	273	\$327,600	<b>1,283</b>	<b>\$2,358,400</b>
2018	175	\$1,300,000	1,010	\$1,212,000	273	\$327,600	<b>1,458</b>	<b>\$2,839,600</b>
2019	200	\$1,600,000	1,185	\$1,422,000	273	\$327,600	<b>1,658</b>	<b>\$3,349,600</b>
2020	225	\$1,800,000	1,385	\$1,662,000	273	\$327,600	<b>1,883</b>	<b>\$3,789,600</b>
2021	225	\$1,800,000	1,610	\$1,932,000	273	\$327,600	<b>2,108</b>	<b>\$4,059,600</b>
2022	420	\$4,000,000	1,835	\$2,202,000	273	\$327,600	<b>2,528</b>	<b>\$6,529,600</b>
2023	420	\$4,000,000	2,255	\$2,706,000	273	\$327,600	<b>2,948</b>	<b>\$7,033,600</b>
2024	425	\$4,000,000	2,675	\$3,210,000	273	\$327,600	<b>3,373</b>	<b>\$7,537,600</b>
2025	0	-	3,100	\$3,720,000	273	\$327,600	<b>3,373</b>	<b>\$4,047,600</b>

## Fuels Management Plan: Funds Available

2015 through 2025

	Funding Source	Detail	Available \$
1	General Fund <sup>1</sup>	Project 550000 existing balance (District-Wide Fuels & Fire Management project account)	\$1,142,500
		Project 550000 future allocations (increase current \$500,000 annual base budget appropriation by \$100,000 each of the next five years to increase annual budget to \$1,000,000 per year)	\$9,500,000
		Undesignated - Fire Operations (\$200,000 annually, 2016 through 2025)	\$2,000,000
2	Measure CC <sup>2</sup>	Balance of Existing CC Funds	\$4,134,919
		Possible CC Renewal (2021 to 2025)	\$2,800,000
3	Grants: Currently Approved <sup>3</sup>	Initial Entry	\$2,750,669
		Maintenance	\$536,100
4	Grants: Future Prospects <sup>4</sup>	Initial Entry (includes FEMA \$1.9 million, plus new FEMA)	\$10,900,000
		Maintenance (\$300,000 annually, 2015 through 2025)	\$3,300,000
<b>TOTAL FUNDING AVAILABLE</b>			<b>\$37,064,188</b>

Projected Funding Needs for Initial Entry and Maintenance, 2015 - 2025      **\$44,789,600**

Total Estimated Shortfall      **(\$7,725,412)**

<sup>1</sup> The District has appropriated a total of \$3.2 million to Project 550000 over the past 8 years. This amount is the remainder currently available. The Board has approved a base budget appropriation of \$500,000 per year. Staff recommends a \$100,000 increase in this annual base budget appropriation each of the following 5 years until a total annual base budget appropriation of \$1,000,000 per year is reached. The undesignated General Fund annual amount is budgeted for several Fire-related purposes, and is subject to expenditure on an annual basis depending on the severity of the fire season.

<sup>2</sup> Initial CC allocations totaled \$8.5 million, of which \$5.8 has been appropriated to projects for expenditure. These amounts listed are the remainder unspent CC funds, both appropriated and unappropriated, dedicated to this program. A possible renewal of Measure CC could provide a total of \$8.5 million with \$2.8 million being available within the first five years.

<sup>3</sup> Existing Grants from FEMA, Diablo Fire Safe Council and the California Fire Safe Council and Calfire.

<sup>4</sup> These amounts are estimates based on the District's past experience and understanding of funds that should become available in future years from FEMA and other sources.